

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK

-----X	:	
ROBERT DEREK LURCH, JR.,	:	
	:	
Plaintiff,	:	
	:	22-CV-2324 (VSB)
-against-	:	
	:	<u>ORDER</u>
P.O. ERIC KIM, P.O. AMANDA	:	
PSAREAS, JOHN DOE Officers that	:	
assisted in detaining and transporting the	:	
Plaintiff, DR. JONATHAN HOWARD, K.	:	
CARTY, <i>registered nurse</i> , and JOHN DOE	:	
Officers that arrested Plaintiff on 40th and	:	
8th Ave. on May 9, 2021 around 7 PM to	:	
7:45 PM,	:	
	:	
Defendants.	:	
	:	
-----X	:	

VERNON S. BRODERICK, United States District Judge:

I am in receipt of Plaintiff’s letter, dated February 1, 2024, requesting a second order pursuant to *Valentin v. Dinkins*, 121 F.3d 72 (2d Cir. 1997), to assist him in identifying the newly added defendants in his Second Amended Complaint, (Doc. 67), and a letter by Assistant Corporation Counsel of the City of New York—here, counsel to Defendants Kim and Psareas—dated February 14, 2024, opposing the request, (Doc. 71). Specifically, Plaintiff seeks assistance identifying the (1) “John Doe Officers that arrested Plaintiff on 40th and 8th Ave. on May 9, 2021 around 7 PM to 7:45 PM,” and (2) “John Doe Officers that assisted in detaining and transporting the Plaintiff.” (Doc. 58.) For substantially the same reasons set forth in my Order of December 13, 2022, (Doc. 30), Plaintiff’s request is DENIED. As before, Plaintiff has provided limited information that would permit the City of New York to identify the John Doe officers. Moreover, Plaintiff has failed to specify how the various officers he intends to sue were

involved in his arrest, detention, and transportation to Bellevue Hospital. *See, e.g., Flowers v. Sehl*, No. 22-cv-2766, 2022 WL 1471038, at *1 (S.D.N.Y. May 10, 2022) (declining to issue a *Valentin* Order where “[p]laintiff alleges no facts showing how these Doe defendants were directly involved in violating his rights, and provides no information would that allow any City agency to identify these defendants”); *Booker v. Griffin*, No. 16-cv-00072, 2018 WL 1614346, at *20 (S.D.N.Y. Mar. 31, 2018) (declining to issue a *Valentin* Order where a plaintiff failed to state a claim against the unknown party); *see also Harding v. New York*, No. 22-cv-6285, 2022 WL 3156414, at *2 n.2 (S.D.N.Y. Aug. 8, 2022) (declining to issue a *Valentin* Order where plaintiff did not specifically assert how unidentified defendants had violated his rights or provide sufficient information to identify them); *Burns v. Un-Named Emps. of N.Y.C. Corr. & Health & Hosps.*, No. 22-cv-2371, 2022 WL 2708869, at *2 (S.D.N.Y. June 7, 2022) (same); *Jones v. Bloomberg*, No. 14-cv-6402, 2014 WL 4652669, at *2 n.2 (S.D.N.Y. Sept. 17, 2014) (same).

SO ORDERED.

Dated: February 16, 2024
New York, New York

A handwritten signature in black ink, reading "Vernon Broderick". The signature is written in a cursive, slightly stylized font. The first letter "V" is large and prominent, and the last letter "k" has a long, sweeping tail that extends to the right.

Vernon S. Broderick
United States District Judge